



GRADY MOORE  
t: (205) 226-8718  
f: (205) 226-8799  
e: gmoore@balch.com

March 8, 2024

FILED VIA CM/ECF

David J. Smith  
Clerk of Court  
U.S. Court of Appeals for the 11th Circuit  
56 Forsyth St., N.W.  
Atlanta, Georgia 30303

**Re: Response to EPA's Rule 28(j) Citation of *Oklahoma v. U.S. EPA*, No. 23-9514 (10th Cir. Feb. 27, 2024) as Supplemental Authority in *Alabama, et al. v. U.S. EPA*, No. 23-11173**

Dear Mr. Smith:

This Court should reject the application of §7607(b)(1) found in *Oklahoma*. The Tenth Circuit errs by conflating the relevant EPA *action* with EPA's omnibus federal register *notice*. While Petitioners agree that the nature of EPA's administrative action, not the petition, controls whether that action is nationally or regionally applicable, slip op. 11; *Hunt Refining Co. v. EPA*, 90 F.4th 1107, 1110 (11th Cir. 2024), the action here is only EPA's disapproval of the Alabama SIP. Under the Clean Air Act, EPA is required to, and did, act on each state's SIP *independent* of its determination as to any other state's SIP. 42 U.S.C. §7410(k); 88 Fed. Reg. 9,336, 9,354-61 (Feb. 13, 2023). EPA's decision to publish its separate reviews in a single notice does not override the statutory requirement. The Tenth Circuit's opinion fails to recognize that EPA sometimes combines distinct actions into single federal register notices. *See* Pet'rs' Reply Br. 21 n.5. Instead, the panel empowers EPA to eschew Congress's design for regional circuit review simply by packaging separate actions into one notice. Nothing in the "plain text" of §7607(b)(1) authorizes EPA to dictate venue in this way.

The panel emphasizes the scope of the petition is not controlling but looks outside the nature of the discrete EPA action taken and considers EPA's policy approach—this is

inconsistent with the court’s own venue standard. *See* slip op. 12-14. Additionally, Judge Moritz cites *Hunt* to support her opinion yet ignores that this Court specifically distinguished the action at issue in *Hunt* from SIP approvals and disapprovals. Slip op. 13-14; 90 F.4th at 1111-12. This distinction is critical because EPA’s SIP actions were each based on state-specific factors. 88 Fed. Reg. at 9,354-61. Finally, Judge Moritz’s claim that §7607(b)(1) should “centralize judicial review,” slip op. 16, does not pass muster because even EPA found venue appropriate in the local circuits for each of its companion SIP *approvals*. *See* Pet’rs’ Jurisdictional Question Resp. 7 n.5.

Petitioners in *Oklahoma* are seeking Supreme Court review of the Tenth Circuit’s venue decision. *See Oklahoma v. EPA*, No. 23-9561, Doc. 11071730 (10th Cir. Mar. 5, 2024).

Respectfully submitted,

STEVE MARSHALL  
ATTORNEY GENERAL

/s/ Robert D. Tambling  
Robert D. Tambling (TAM001)  
*Assistant Attorney General*

/s/ Lindsay S. Dawson Barton  
Lindsay S. Dawson Barton (DAW017)  
*Assistant Attorney General*

/s/ Steven Shawn Sibley  
Steven Shawn Sibley (SIB002)  
*Assistant Attorney General*

**ADDRESS OF COUNSEL:**

Office of the Attorney General  
501 Washington Avenue  
Montgomery, Alabama 36130-0152  
Telephone: (334) 242-7300  
Fax: (334) 242-2848  
E-Mail: [Robert.Tambling@AlabamaAG.gov](mailto:Robert.Tambling@AlabamaAG.gov)

/s/ Paul Christian Sasser, Jr.

Paul Christian Sasser, Jr.

*Assistant Attorney General*

**ADDRESS OF COUNSEL:**

Alabama Department of Environmental Management

Office of General Counsel

P.O. Box 301463

Montgomery, Alabama 36130-1463

Phone: (334) 271-7855

Fax: (334) 260-4544

Email: pcsasser@adem.alabama.gov

s/ C. Grady Moore III

C. Grady Moore III

Claire B. Johnson

BALCH & BINGHAM LLP

1901 6th Ave. N., Ste. 1500

Birmingham, Alabama 35203

205-251-8100

[gmoore@balch.com](mailto:gmoore@balch.com)

*Counsel for Alabama Power Company and  
PowerSouth Energy Cooperative*

**CERTIFICATE OF INTERESTED PERSONS AND CORPORATE  
DISCLOSURE STATEMENT**

Pursuant to Federal Rule of Appellate Procedure 26.1 and Eleventh Circuit Rule 26.1-1, the undersigned counsel certifies the following corporate disclosure statements:

Alabama Power Company (“Alabama Power”) is a corporation organized under the laws of the State of Alabama. Alabama Power is a regulated public utility engaged in the generation, transmission, distribution and purchase of electricity and the sale of electric service within a service area comprising most of the State of Alabama. The Southern Company (trading symbol “SO”) owns all of Alabama Power’s outstanding common stock, which represents a substantial majority of the overall voting power of Alabama Power’s equity securities. Alabama Power also has preferred stock outstanding, all of which are publicly traded (trading symbol “ALP PR Q” for 5.00% Series Class A Preferred Stock).

PowerSouth Energy Cooperative (“PowerSouth”) is a non-profit generation and transmission cooperative, serving the wholesale power needs of twenty distribution members—sixteen electric cooperatives and four municipal electric systems—for more than one-million end users in thirty-nine Alabama and ten northwest Florida counties. PowerSouth is owned by its twenty distribution members. PowerSouth does not have a parent corporation and has not issued shares

to the public. No publicly held company has a 10% or greater ownership in PowerSouth.

Undersigned counsel further certifies that the following persons or entities have been associated with or have an interest in the outcome of this case:

Alabama Department of Environmental Management

Alabama Power Company (ALP-PQ)

Balch & Bingham LLP, Counsel, Alabama Power Company and PowerSouth

Energy Cooperative

Barton, Lindsay S. Dawson, Counsel, State of Alabama

Garland, Merrick B., Attorney General, United States Department of Justice

Gettle, Jeananne, Acting Region 4 Administrator, United States Environmental Protection Agency

Jensen, Miranda M., United States Department of Justice

Johnson, Claire B., Counsel, Alabama Power Company and PowerSouth Energy Cooperative

Kim, Todd, Assistant Attorney General, Environment and Natural Resources Division, United States Department of Justice

LeFleur, Lance R., Director, Alabama Department of Environmental Management

Lin, Albert, United States Department of Justice

Marshall, Steve, Attorney General, State of Alabama

Moore III, C. Grady, Counsel, Alabama Power Company and PowerSouth Energy  
Cooperative

PowerSouth Energy Cooperative

Prieto, Jeffrey M., General Counsel, United States Environmental Protection  
Agency

Regan, Michael S., Administrator, United States Environmental Protection Agency

SABIC Innovative Plastics US, LLC

Sasser, Paul Christian, Jr., Counsel, Alabama Department of Environmental  
Management

Saudi Basic Industries Corporation (2010.SR)

Sibley, Steven Shawn, Counsel, State of Alabama

State of Alabama

The Southern Company (SO) (Parent Company of Petitioner Alabama Power  
Company)

Tambling, Robert D., Counsel, State of Alabama

United States Environmental Protection Agency

**Dated: March', 2024**

Respectfully submitted,

s/ C. Grady Moore III  
C. Grady Moore III  
Claire B. Johnson  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1901 6th Ave. N., Ste. 1500  
Birmingham, Alabama 35203  
205-251-8100  
[gmoore@balch.com](mailto:gmoore@balch.com)

*Counsel for Alabama Power Company and  
PowerSouth Energy Cooperative*

**CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE**

The undersigned counsel states that this letter complies with Fed. R. App. P. 28(j) because the body of the letter does not exceed 350 words.

Dated: March 8, 2024

/s/ C. Grady Moore III  
C. Grady Moore III  
*Counsel for Alabama Power Company and  
PowerSouth Energy Cooperative*

/s/ Robert D. Tambling  
Robert D. Tambling (TAM001)  
*Assistant Attorney General*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this 8th day of March 2024, I have filed the foregoing letter using the Court's CM/ECF system, which will electronically serve all counsel of record registered to use the CM/ECF system.

/s/ C. Grady Moore III  
C. Grady Moore III  
*Counsel for Alabama Power Company and  
PowerSouth Energy Cooperative*

/s/ Robert D. Tambling  
Robert D. Tambling (TAM001)  
*Assistant Attorney General*